

Caroline Buts
José Luis Buendía Sierra (eds)

Milestones in State Aid Case Law

EStAL's First 15 Years in Perspective

 **EStAL** EUROPEAN
STATE AID
LAW QUARTERLY

THE LEGAL PUBLISHER
lexxion
● BERLIN
● BRUSSELS

Table of Contents

Foreword	
EStAL and the Sword in the Stone	V
Chapter 1 · BP Chemicals	
<i>BP Chemicals: Lessons to Be Recalled in the Context of Applying the MEIP to Consecutive State Measures in the Financial Sector</i> ^{*2017}	2
<i>Matgorzata Agnieszka Cyndecka</i>	
Chapter 2 · PreussenElektra	
<i>PreussenElektra – Dead or Alive?</i> ^{*2017}	16
<i>Kai Struckmann</i>	
Chapter 3 · Sardegna	
Every Family Is the Same, Every Family Is Different: State Aid and Free Movement ^{*2017}	34
<i>Andrea Biondi</i>	
Chapter 4 · Stardust Marine	
Notion d’Aide d’Etat Remarques sur l’Arrêt Stardust Marine du 16 Mai 2002	46
<i>Alain Alexis</i>	
The Stardust Marine Case (C-482/99) ^{*2017}	56
<i>Juan Jorge Piernas López</i>	
Chapter 5 · SMI	
The SMI-Judgment – a New Course for Recovery of Illegal State Aid?	70
<i>Andreas Knaul</i>	
The Principles for Recovery: SMI or the Importance of a Meticulous Assessment of State Interventions by the Granting Authorities and the Commission ^{*2017}	77
<i>Maria J. Segura, Marianne Clayton and Egill Olafsson</i>	

Chapter 6 · Altmark

- Bidding Procedures in EC State Aid Surveillance over Public Services after Altmark Trans** 90
Ulrich Schnelle
- Altmark: The Mount Everest of State Aid***²⁰¹⁷ 96
Phedon Nicolaides and Guido Paolini

Chapter 7 · Chronopost

- Chronopost II: The Application of the Market Economy Investor Principle in Reserved Sectors** 114
Isabela Atanasiu
- Chronopost I – Re-Annotated***²⁰¹⁷ 120
Andreas Bartosch

Chapter 8 · Pearle

- “Pearle: So Much Unsaid!”** 128
Edoardo Gambaro, Alessandro Nucara, Luca Prete
- Pearle Revisited – Or Does Our State Aided Vision Really Improve with Hindsight?***²⁰¹⁷ 152
Leigh Hancher

Chapter 9 · BUPA

- BUPA v. Commission** 160
Andrea Biondi
- Case T-289/03 BUPA: The Illusion of Flexibility That Strengthened Altmark***²⁰¹⁷ 170
Alfonso Lamadrid de Pablo

Chapter 10 · Forum 187

- Case Report Joined Cases C-182/03 (Belgium) and C-217/03 (Forum 187) v. Commission** 180
Jayant Mehta
- Belgium and Forum 187 v. Commission Revisited: A Sound and Correct Legal Source for an At Arm’s Length Principle?***²⁰¹⁷ 197
Tony Joris and Wout De Cock

Chapter 11 · Azores	
Review of the Judgment in Case C-88/03, <i>Portugal v. Commission</i> (Azores Tax Regime)	214
<i>Carsten Zatschler</i>	
Tales from an Outermost Region: How Does the Azores Judgment Look from a Distance?* ²⁰¹⁷	223
<i>Fiona Wisblade</i>	
 Chapter 12 · Ryanair Charleroi	
CFI Judgment in the Charleroi Case T-196/04.	234
<i>Dennis Oswell, George Metaxas and Esfandiar Vahida</i>	
The Ryanair Charleroi Judgment: What Is Its Legacy?* ²⁰¹⁷	246
<i>Nicole Robins and Hannes Geldof</i>	
 Chapter 13 · Laboratoires Boiron	
Review of Judgment Laboratoires Boiron, Case C-526/04.	264
<i>Holger Wissel and Dominik Becker</i>	
Laboratoires Boiron SA v ACOSS: A Retrospective* ²⁰¹⁷	272
<i>Isabel Taylor</i>	
 Chapter 14 · Athinaiki I & II	
Athinaiki Techniki II.	282
<i>Sébastien Thomas</i>	
The Status of Complainants in State Aid Cases: A Look Back into the <i>Athinkaiki Techniki</i> Saga* ²⁰¹⁷	300
<i>Fernando Pastor-Merchant</i>	
 Chapter 15 · CELF I & II	
The CELF-Judgment: A Precarious Conception of the Standstill Obligation	314
<i>Thomas Jaeger</i>	
Judgment of the Court of the European Union in Case C-1/09, <i>CELF v SIDE</i>.	334
<i>Adrien Giraud</i>	
The Powers and Obligations of National Courts with Regard to Unlawful State Aid: Lessons Learned from <i>CELF I</i> and <i>CELF II</i>* ²⁰¹⁷	342
<i>Jacques Derenne</i>	

Chapter 16 · British Aggregates

Selectivity and Taxation – Reflections in the Light of Case C-487/06 P, British Aggregates Association 358

Michael Honoré

The *British Aggregates* Saga – Looking Back at an Earlier Stage of the Selectivity Discussion^{*2017} 377

Clemens Ziegler

Chapter 17 · Paint Graphos

The Preliminary Ruling of the Court of Justice on Preferential Taxation of Cooperatives and State Aid Rules 386

Flavia Tomat

Finding Selectivity or the Art of Comparison^{*2017} 410

José Luis Buendía Sierra

Chapter 18 · Dutch NOx

NOx Emission Trading Rights: A Government Gift or Value Created by Undertakings? 424

Piet Jan Slot

The *NOx Case* – Still Trying to Fit in a System^{*2017} 438

Philipp Werner

Chapter 19 · DHL Leipzig Halle

State Aid and Public Funding for Infrastructure^{*2017} 454

Erika Szyszczak

Chapter 20 · Smurfit Kappa

Commission Guidelines and their Limits T-304/08 *Smurfit Kappa*^{*2017} 466

Vincent Verouden

Chapter 21 · Gibraltar

Gibraltar: Beyond the Pillars of Hercules of Selectivity 480

Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico

***Gibraltar*: A Landmark Judgment Which Was Not Meant to Be**^{*2017} 489

Pierpaolo Rossi-Maccanico

Chapter 22 · EDF	
Tax Measures and the Private Investor Test: The Court of Justice	
Endorses a Level Playing Field	508
<i>Niels Baeten and Liliane Gam</i>	
European Commission v <i>Electricité de France</i> – a Distant Mirror * ²⁰¹⁷	517
<i>Bernhard von Wendland and Hanna Standtke</i>	
Chapter 23 · France Télécom	
The <i>Bouygues</i> Case: A Never Ending Story	532
<i>María Muñoz de Juan</i>	
Can Mere Declarations by a State Be Considered as an Advantage Drawn from State Resources: An Economic Perspective * ²⁰¹⁷	552
<i>Alejandro Requejo Tovar</i>	
Chapter 24 · TV2 Danmark	
The Origin of State Resources: Awaiting the Court's Ruling in Case C-656/15 P <i>European Commission v TV2/Danmark A/S</i> * ²⁰¹⁷	560
<i>Mihalis Kekeleki</i>	
Chapter 25 · Ryanair v Commission	
Appeal against Alitalia State Aid Decisions by Ryanair Dismissed ..	570
<i>John Milligan and Luke Sales</i>	
Case C-287/12 P, <i>Ryanair v. Commission</i>: a Tale of Lost Opportunity * ²⁰¹⁷	584
<i>Elisabetta Righini</i>	
Chapter 26 · Deutsche Lufthansa	
Binding Effect of Opening Decisions – <i>Lufthansa AG v FFH</i>	604
<i>Lucyne Ghazarian</i>	
The Obligations of National Courts after an Opening Decision * ²⁰¹⁷	616
<i>Lucyne Ghazarian and Christian Koenig</i>	
Chapter 27 · Ciudad de la Luz	
Public Investment in a Cinema Studio and State Aid Rules:	
The Last Showing	624
<i>Marianne Clayton, Maria J. Segura, Egill D. Ólafsson</i>	
<i>Ciudad de la Luz</i> Judgment – An In-Depth Review of the Market Economy Investor Principle * ²⁰¹⁷	641
<i>Adina Claiici</i>	

Chapter 28 · ING

Testing the Soundness of the Commission’s Practice on State Aid to the Financial Sector 652
Jose Manuel Panero Rivas
The ING Case *2017 666
Piet Jan Slot

Chapter 29 · Eventech

Eventech, the Selectivity of a Bus Lines Policy*2017 680
Laura Parret and Greetje van Heezik

Chapter 30 · Mediaset

It May Be Zero! CJEU Highlights National Courts’ Authority to Review and Determine Amounts of Aid to Be Recovered. 694
Nina Niejahr
Mediaset III: The Recovery Revolution Deactivated*2017 703
Massimo Merola

Chapter 31 · Klausner Holz

State Aid as a Defence for Public Authorities? 718
Grith Skovgaard Ølykke
Annotation on the Judgment C-505/14
Klausner Holz Niedersachsen v Land Nordrhein-Westfalen*2017 727
Péter Staviczky

Chapter 32 · World Duty Free Group

Bury Them Deep: The Court of Justice Annuls the *Autogrill* and *Banco Santander* Judgments of the General Court 740
Adrien Giraud and Sylvain Petit
Joined Cases C-20/15 P and C-21/15 P,
European Commission v World Duty Free Group SA, Banco Santander SA and Santusa Holding SL *2017 750
Conor Quigley QC

* Case revisited in 2017.